

**PURCHASE AREA DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING  
SPECIAL CALLED MEETING**

**March 27, 2018**

---

The Purchase Area Development District Board of Directors met on Tuesday, March 27, 2018, at 3:00 p.m., at the West Kentucky Rural Electric Cooperative (WKRECC) Community Room, 1218 West Broadway, Mayfield, KY. Board members in attendance, asterisk denotes absence:

Ballard  
Judge/Executive Todd Cooper  
Mayor George Lane\*  
Justin Puckett

Graves  
Judge/Executive Jesse Perry  
Mayor Teresa Rochetti-Cantrell, Chair\*  
Mayor Charles Shelby\*  
Tamie Johnson  
Pete Galloway  
Deric Todd\*

Calloway  
Executive Larry Elkins  
Mayor Jack Rose  
Joe Bolin\*  
Sue Outland  
Mark Manning

Hickman  
Judge/Executive Kenny Wilson, Secretary  
Mayor Phyllis Campbell\*  
Judy Stephens  
Howard Dillard

Carlisle  
Judge/Executive Greg Terry, Treasurer

Marshall  
Scott Brown, proxy for Judge/Executive Kevin Neal  
Mayor Rita Dotson  
John Ward  
Brad Warning\*

Nancy Henley  
Bill Fraser

Fulton  
Judge/Executive Jim Martin  
Mayor David Prater\*  
Mayor David Lattus\*  
Perry Turner\*  
Greg Curlin

McCracken  
Judge/Executive Bob Leeper  
Josh Sommer, proxy for Mayor Brandi Harless  
Frances Hamilton\*  
Arthur Boykin, Vice-Chair  
Lee King  
Dee Felts, proxy for Pam Wright  
Bill Bartleman

Guests Present:

Dennis Null, West Kentucky Allied Services Attorney  
Nicholas Thomas, West Kentucky Allied Services Attorney  
Debbie Lawrence, WKAS/Ballard County  
Elizabeth Lamb, Director, Mayfield Graves County Senior Citizens Center  
Janna York, WKAS

Phillip Dowdy, WKAS  
Genece Gibson, Carlisle County Senior Citizens Center  
Samantha Breedlove, WKAS  
Ken Dodd, WKAS  
Tammy Lockhart, WKAS  
Gregg Knight, WKAS  
Temple Hill, WKAS  
Noel Coplen, Graves County Health Department  
Guelda Wooldridge, Director, Paducah/McCracken Senior Citizens Center  
Mark McLemore, Murray/Calloway County Senior Citizens Center  
Stacey Blankenship, PADD Attorney  
Jeanna Puckett, WKAS  
Alfred Anderson, WKAS

I. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Arthur Boykin called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm and introduced the proxies and guests.

**Mayor Jack Rose motioned for the items tabled from the March 19<sup>th</sup> PADD Board of Directors meeting be opened back up for action, Judge/Executive Greg Terry seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.**

**Mr. Bill Bartleman made a motion to go into executive session pursuant to KRS 61.810(1)(c) and (m) to discuss a matter which could lead to litigation against or on behalf of the public agency and to discuss a record exempted from the Kentucky Open Records Act, Mr. Jack Rose seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.**

At 3:34 the PADD Board Special Called meeting was called back into session. **Mr. Bill Bartleman motioned for the meeting to be back in public session, Mayor Jack Rose seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.**

Chair Boykin shared that the agenda had 8 items to be voted on at the special called meeting, after the motion and second, he noted there would be 5 minutes for comments from board members and guests. Mr. John Ward asked if it would be possible to limit discussion to 3 minutes for time. Chair Boykin set a 3-minute time limit per person for comments.

Chair Boykin called on Ms. Lee King for the Aging Committee Report. Ms. King began her report by stating that Homecare Home Management had two bidders for the current RFP; the current provider, West Kentucky Allied Services and a new competitor, Help at Home. Ms. King referred to the handout that each bidder had bid to serve all eight (8) counties of the Purchase and their proposed per unit rates for services were Help at Home, \$9.98 per unit and WKAS, \$11.55 per unit. **Ms. King made the recommendation of the Aging Committee, that Help at Home be approved to receive the contract award to provide the Homecare Essential Services Home Management throughout the Purchase counties.**

**Mr. Pete Galloway made the motion to reconsider the vote on Homecare Home Management, Justin Puckett seconded the motion and Chair Boykin asked for all that agreed to say aye and everyone present on the PADD Board of Directors agreed, except for Mr. Bill Fraser. The motion passed with the majority.**

Chair Boykin again asked for Ms. King to make her motion for the Aging Committee. **Ms. King made a motion for the recommendation of the Aging Committee, that Help at Home be approved to receive the contract award to provide the Homecare Essential Services Home Management throughout the Purchase counties, Mayor Jack Rose seconded the motion,** and then, Chair Boykin asked for comments. Debbie Lawrence, from Ballard County West Kentucky Allied Services, asked about the roll call vote that was made at the March 19<sup>th</sup> meeting to approve WKAS bid. Mr. Bartleman commented that the vote was to reject the Aging Committee's recommendation and the Board agreed to table the action items in the Aging report. Chair Boykin recognized Ms. Tamie Johnson with a question, Ms. Johnson asked if the ADD was on a deadline for the contracts in question and if we did not award the contract, would services stop for the clients. Ms. Walker replied that the ADD had an approved RFP timeline with the State, the PADD staff would have to submit an amended timeline; the current contract ends on June 30<sup>th</sup>, if the state approved an extended timeline, it could not be past June 30, 2018, or the date the state granted the PADD.

**Chair Boykin conducted a roll call to approve the Aging Committee recommendation. The vote was cast with 10 yes, 5 no and 9 abstentions recorded. Chair Boykin announced that the bid would be awarded to Help At Home, by majority**

Chair Boykin called on Ms. King for the next item on the agenda, Personal Care. Ms. King shared that two bidders were submitted for this service; the current provider, West Kentucky Allied Services, and a new competitor, Help at Home. The bid was to serve all eight (8) of the Purchase Counties and their proposed per unit rates for services are listed as Help At Home at \$9.98 per unit and WKAS at \$11.55 per unit. **Ms. King stated that based on the recommendation of the Aging Committee, she made the motion to approve Help at Home to receive the contract award to provide the HomeCare Essential Services Personal Care throughout the Purchase counties, Dee Felts seconded the motion.** Chair Boykins asked for comments, no questions were asked. **Chair Boykin conducted a roll call and results were 10 yes votes, 5 no votes and 9 abstentions. The motion passed with a majority to approve the contract to be awarded to Help At Home.**

Chair Boykin called on Ms. King for the report on Homecare Respite. Ms. King shared that two bidders were presented for the Homecare Respite contract; WKAS is the current provider and Help At Home also submitted a bid. Ms. King shared that the Help at Home listed a \$9.98 per unit and WKAS listed a \$9.00 per unit. **Ms. King stated that on based on the recommendation of the Aging Committee, she moved to approve WKAS to receive the contract award to provide the Homecare Essential Services Respite throughout the Purchase counties, Mayor Jack Rose seconded the motion, Chair Boykin conducted a roll call with 12 yes votes, 3 no votes and 9 abstentions recorded. The motion passed with a majority to approve the contract to be awarded to WKAS.**

Next, Chair Boykin called on Ms. King for the Homecare Chore recommendation. Ms. King reported that the two bids were received, the current provider, WKAS, and Help At Home. Help At Home submitted \$9.98 per unit and WKAS submitted \$11.55 per unit. Based on the recommendation of the Aging Committee, **Ms. King motioned for Help At Home to be approved to receive the contract award to provide the Homecare Essential Services of CHORE throughout the Purchase counties, Ms. Sue Outland seconded the motion and Chair Boykin conducted a roll call recording 9 yes votes, 6 no votes, and 9 abstentions. The motion passed to award Help At Home the contract with a majority.**

Chair Boykin called on Ms. King for the Homecare Home Repair recommendation. Ms. King shared that two bids were received. It was noted that, currently, WKAS services all of the Purchase area, except McCracken County, and McCracken County Senior Citizens currently serves McCracken County. McCracken County Senior Citizens Center submitted a bid to continue serving McCracken County at a unit rate of \$13.33. West Kentucky Allied Services submitted a bid to serve all eight of the Purchase District and their proposed per unit rate for this service was McCracken County at \$13.00 per unit and all other Purchase counties at \$13.65 per unit. Based on the recommendation of the Aging Committee, **Ms. King moved that West Kentucky Allied Services be approved to receive the contract award to provide the Homecare Essential Services Home Repair in all Purchase counties except McCracken, and that McCracken be approved to receive the contract award to provide Home Repair in McCracken County, Mr. Bill Bartleman seconded the motion.** Chair Boykin asked for questions from the floor. Mr. Bartleman asked why it was awarded to McCracken County at a higher per unit cost. Ms. King shared that the score was higher. Ms. Stephens asked what was the score, and Ms. Ponder shared that the McCracken County Senior Citizens Center score was 355 and WKAS was 317. Judge Cooper asked why was it recommended by scores instead of dollars as in the past recommendations. Ms. King responded that the recommendations are not based only on cost per unit, but in conjunction with the scores process. Judge Perry commented that Aging Committee scoring system was incorrect at the Aging Committee meeting. Ms. Walker agreed with Judge Perry and explained that the Aging Committee meeting packet was incorrect that WKAS had a lower bid in McCracken county but was verbally corrected at the meeting to include the correct price per unit. Mr. Bartleman asked if the scoring was based on the application, and nothing to do with performance. Ms. Ponder addressed the question, she shared that scoring not only included whether or not the application was complete, but also rules and regulations were considered. **Mr. Bartleman made a motion to withdraw his second on the motion to approve WKAS services for 7 counties and approve McCracken County for McCracken county for the Homecare Home Repair contract.**

**Mr. Bartleman made the motion to remove McCracken County from Ms. King's original motion made for the Homecare Home Repair, Mayor Jack Rose seconded the motion. Chair Boykin conducted a roll call with 15 yes votes, 0 no votes, and 9 abstentions. The amended motion passed to only include 7 counties.**

**Chair Boykin then asked for a second on Ms. King's recommendation for the 7 counties bid for Homecare Home Repair, Mr. Bill Fraser seconded the motion. Chair Boykin conducted roll call and recorded 14 yes votes, 0 no votes, and 9 abstentions. The motion passed to award the Homecare Home Repair to WKAS for 7 counties.**

Mr. Bartleman referred a question to Ms. Stacey Blankenship about the PADD Board needing a reason for why they would accept a higher bid for McCracken County. Ms. Blankenship agreed that a reason would need to be included in the motion.

Chair Boykin then called on **Ms. King for a motion for Homecare Home Repair for McCracken County, at 13.33 per unit cost, with a justification of the higher bid being awarded to McCracken, with the higher score received, Mr. Bill Fraser seconded the motion.** Mr. Bartleman asked for an explanation of why McCracken County had a higher score, Ms. Simpson shared a few areas of differences. Mr. Mark Manning asked how the weight on each score and cost and who decides that; Ms. Ponder shared that the Project Review Committee as a subcommittee of the Aging Committee set the standard scoring system. Ms. Simpson continued to address Mr. Manning's question that the score and price is weighted equally. Ms. Judy Stephens asked questions about the scoring sheets, she stated that in some scoring, a 2 was scored with discrepancies in the narrative, they had completed a section, but didn't meet all the requirements. Mr. Bartleman asked if the RFP addresses the scoring system, Ms. Simpson referred to the letter of application that refers to the scoring system. **Chair Boykin conducted a roll call; the vote recorded 5 yes votes, 8 no votes, and 6 abstentions and the motion failed with majority.**

Chair Boykin opened the floor for a motion for a recommendation to fulfill the Homecare Home Repair contract, **Mr. Howard Dillard recommended the contract for Homecare Home Repair be awarded to WKAS in McCracken County, Mr. Bill Fraser seconded the motion, Chair Boykin conducted the roll call with 10 yes votes, 2 no votes, and 6 abstentions. Without a quorum, the recommendation was not approved.**

No further business could be conducted without a quorum being present.

Ms. Walker shared that the PADD Bylaws require a 7-day notice to conduct a special called meeting. Ms. Walker asked, at the pleasure of the board, that the PADD staff make a request of the State to amend the RFP timeline and extend the contract recommendation for Homecare Home Repair, Homecare Escort, Homecare Delivered Meals and Home Delivered Frozen/Emergency Meals to the regular April PADD Board of Directors meeting.

## II. ADJOURNMENT

**Chair Boykin adjourned the meeting.**

---

Chair, Mayor Teresa Rochetti-Cantrell

---

Secretary, Judge/Executive Kenny Wilson